STATE OF RHODE ISLAND

DIVISION OF TAXATION

ADMINISTRATIVE HEARING

FINAL DECISION AND ORDER

#2021-04

STATE OF RHODE ISLAND AND PROVIDENCE PLANTATIONS
DEPARTMENT OF REVENUE
DIVISION OF TAXATION
ONE CAPITOL HILL
PROVIDENCE, RHODE ISLAND 02908

IN THE MATTER OF:	:	**Case No.: 21-T-155**
	:	**Personal Income Tax**
Taxpayers.	:	

DECISION

I. INTRODUCTION

The above-entitled matter came before the undersigned as the result of a Notice of Hearing and Appointment of Hearing Officer ("Notice") dated July 22, 2021 and issued to the above-captioned taxpayers ("Taxpayers") by the Division of Taxation ("Division") in response to a request for hearing. A hearing was scheduled for September 16, 2021 at which the Taxpayers did not appear. Since the Taxpayers were adequately noticed of hearing,[1] a hearing was held before the undersigned on September 16, 2021. Pursuant to Section 2.7(G)(3) of the 280-RICR-20-00-2 *Administrative Hearing Procedures* ("Hearing Regulation"), a default judgment may be entered against the party not appearing at hearing.[2] The Division was represented by counsel and rested on the record.

[1] The Notice was sent to the Taxpayers' address on record with the Division and used by the Taxpayers when requesting a hearing. The Notice was sent by first class and certified mail. The certified mail was delivered. Department's Exhibits One (2016 income tax return filed on November 8, 2019 with address); Four (4) (request for hearing with address); and Eight (8) (Notice and print out of United States Post Office certified mail tracking sheet showing delivery).

[2] The Notice informed the Taxpayers that failure to appear at hearing could lead to a default being entered against him. The Hearing Regulation provides that a defaulted party be given notice of the default by mail and said party may request reinstatement of the matter pursuant to a motion for reconsideration as set forth in the Hearing Regulation.

II. JURISDICTION

The Division has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-1 *et seq.*, R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-1-1 *et seq.*, the Hearing Regulation, and 220-RICR-50-10-2, Department of Administration's *Rules of Procedure for Administrative Hearings*.

III. ISSUE

Whether the Taxpayers' request for a refund from their personal income tax return for 2016 is timely pursuant to R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-87.

IV. MATERIAL FACTS AND TESTIMONY

The Taxpayers' Rhode Island income tax return for the year 2016 requesting a refund was filed with the Division on November 8, 2019. On or about December 10, 2019, the Division issued a letter to the Taxpayers denying their request for a refund and the Taxpayers requested a hearing. See Division's Exhibits One (1) (2016 Rhode Island income tax return filed by Taxpayers on November 8, 2019); Three (3) (Division's denial of refund); and Four (4) (request for hearing).

, Principal Revenue Agent, testified on behalf of the Division. He testified that 2016 income tax returns were due on April 18, 2017. He testified that there is a two (2) year period and a three (3) year period under R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-87 that provides for time to request a refund, and the Taxpayers did not fall under either time period to request a refund.

V. DISCUSSION

A. Legislative Intent

The Rhode Island Supreme Court has consistently held that it effectuates legislative intent by examining a statute in its entirety and giving words their plain and ordinary meaning. *In re Falstaff Brewing Corp.*, 637 A.2d 1047 (R.I. 1994). If a statute is clear and

unambiguous, "the Court must interpret the statute literally and must give the words of the statute their plain and ordinary meanings." *Oliveira v. Lombardi*, 794 A.2d 453 (R.I. 2002) (citation omitted). The Supreme Court has also established that it will not interpret legislative enactments in a manner that renders them nugatory or that would produce an unreasonable result. See *Defenders of Animals v. Dept. of Environmental Management*, 553 A.2d 541 (R.I. 1989) (citing *Cocchini v. City of Providence*, 479 A.2d 108 (R.I. 1984)). In cases where a statute may contain ambiguous language, the Rhode Island Supreme Court has consistently held that the legislative intent must be considered. *Providence Journal Co. v. Rodgers*, 711 A.2d 1131 (R.I. 1998).

B. When Refunds are Allowed

R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-87 provides in part as follows:

> Limitations on credit or refund. – *(a) General.* Claim for credit or refund of an overpayment of tax shall be filed by the taxpayer within three (3) years from the time the return was filed or two (2) years from the time the tax was paid, whichever of these periods expires the later, or if no return was filed by the taxpayer, within two (2) years from the time the tax was paid. If the claim is filed within the three (3) year period, the amount of the credit or refund shall not exceed the portion of the tax paid within the three (3) year period. If the claim is not filed within the three (3) year period, but is filed within the two (2) year period, the amount of the credit or refund shall not exceed the portion of the tax paid during the two (2) years immediately preceding the filing of the claim. Except as otherwise provided in this section, if no claim is filed, the amount of a credit or refund shall not exceed the amount which would be allowable if a claim has been filed on the date the credit or refund is allowed.

R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-87 provides different time periods within which a refund is allowed. A refund may be claimed within three (3) years of filing a return. If a claim is made within the three (3) year period, the amount of credit cannot exceed the amount of tax paid within that three (3) year period. A claim may be filed within two (2) years from the time the tax was paid. If a claim is made within the two (2) year period, the amount of

refund may not exceed the portion of tax paid during the two (2) years preceding the filing of the claim.

Pursuant to R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-87(i),[3] the Taxpayers' tax for 2016 was deemed paid on the date it was due: April 18, 2017.[4] In addition, R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-51[5] states that Rhode Island personal income tax returns are to be filed by April 15 after the close of the taxable year. R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-52[6] states that tax shall be paid on or before the date fixed for filing without regard to an extension. In addition, R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-87(e)[7] specifically precludes any other period of limitations specified in any other laws from being applied to recovery of personal income tax refunds.

Pursuant to the tenets of statutory construction, a statute must be examined in its entirety and words be given their plain and ordinary meaning. *Infra*. The statute states that

---

[3] R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-87(i) states as follows:

> (i) Prepaid income tax. For purposes of this section, any income tax withheld from the taxpayer during any calendar year and any amount paid as estimated income tax for a taxable year is deemed to have been paid by the taxpayer on the fifteenth day of the fourth month following the close of his or her taxable year with respect to which the amount constitutes credit or payment.

[4] As testified to by the Division.

[5] R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-51 states in parts as follows:

> Returns and liabilities. – (a) General. On or before the fifteenth day of the fourth month following the close of a taxable year, a Rhode Island personal income tax return shall be made and filed by or for:
>
> (1) Every resident individual required to file a federal income tax return for the taxable year, or having Rhode Island income for the taxable year, determined under § 44-30-12, in excess of the sum of his federal personal exemptions.

[6] R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-52 states in part as follows:

> Time and place for filing returns and paying tax. – A person required to make and file a Rhode Island personal income tax return shall, without assessment, notice, or demand, pay any tax due thereon to the tax administrator on or before the date fixed for filing the return, determined without regard to any extension of time for filing the return. The tax administrator shall prescribe the place for filing any return, declaration, statement, or other document and for payment of the tax.

[7] R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-87(e), states as follows:

> (e) Failure to file claim within prescribed period. No credit or refund shall be allowed or made, except as provided in subsection (f) of this section, after the expiration of the applicable period of limitation unless a claim for credit or refund is filed by the taxpayer within that period or unless the tax administrator determines under subsection (f) of this section that the taxpayer has made an overpayment. Any later credit shall be void and any later refund erroneous. No period of limitations specified in any other law shall apply to the recovery by a taxpayer of moneys paid in respect of Rhode Island personal income tax.

the beginning of the three (3) year period is when the return was filed and that the time period is *within* three (3) years from when the return was filed. This unambiguous prospective application is further clarified by the fact that the statute clearly delineates that the two (2) year claim period refers to the period immediately preceding the filing date. Indeed, when reviewing the statute in its entirety and applying the plain meaning of the language, it is clear that the legislature intended to strictly limit the time to claim a refund and amounts of refunds. The legislature could have chosen to make the three (3) year period like the two (2) year period but chose not to. Indeed, it chose instead to strictly limit the time allowed and the amount of refunds claimed.

Thus, applying the State statute results in the following timeline:

1. The Taxpayers' 2016 tax was deemed paid April 18, 2017. The Taxpayers were able to request a refund two (2) years from that date. Any claim for a refund filed in the two (2) year period would be limited to amounts paid in the preceding two (2) years.

2. The Taxpayers filed their 2016 Rhode Island return on November 8, 2019.

3. November 8, 2019 is past the two (2) year period from the date the tax was deemed paid that is allowed for requesting a refund.

4. The statute also allows a claim for a refund to be filed within three (3) years from the date of the return being filed.

5. Thus, the Taxpayers may file a request for a refund within three (3) years of filing of the return.

6. The Taxpayers are within the three (3) year period to claim a refund.

7. The statute specifically limits the amount of a refund for those filed in the three (3) year period to the portion of tax paid "within the three (3) year period" as opposed

to those requests filed within the two (2) year period which are limited to tax paid "during the two (2) years immediately preceding the filing of the claim."

8. The Taxpayers have not paid any tax from November 8, 2019 to the present.

In addition, an agency's acquiescence to a continued practice is entitled to great weight in determining legislative intent. R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-87 was enacted in 1971 and has not been amended. P.L. 1971, ch. 8, art. 1, § 1. For example, see *Division Decision*, 1986 WL 58658 (denying refund request as untimely under said statute). While the three (3) year period clearly refers to the period from the date of filing, it is a well-recognized principle that a longstanding, practical and plausible interpretation given a statute of doubtful meaning by those responsible for its implementation without any interference by the Legislature should be accepted as evidence that such a construction conforms to the legislative intent. Thus, if it was found that the statute was unclear, Taxation's long standing interpretation is entitled to deference. *Trice v. City of Cranston*, 297 A.2d 649 (R.I. 1972).

Based on the foregoing, the Taxpayers do not qualify for their claimed refund pursuant to R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-87. See *Tax Decision*, 2007-10 (May 10, 2007).

VI. FINDINGS OF FACT

1. On or about July 22, 2021, the Division issued a Notice of Hearing and Appointment of Hearing Officer to the Taxpayers.

2. A hearing in this matter was held on September 16, 2021. The Taxpayers received notice of hearing but did not appear at hearing.

3. The Taxpayers are in default for not appearing at the hearing.

4. The Taxpayers' 2016 tax payment was due by April 18, 2017 and was deemed paid that day.

5. The Taxpayers filed their 2016 return on November 8, 2019 and claimed a refund for overpayment of tax.

6. Pursuant to R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-87(a), the Taxpayers are not entitled to the claimed refund.

VII. CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

Based on the testimony and facts presented:

1. The Division has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-1 *et seq*. and R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-1-1 *et seq*.

2. Pursuant to R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-40-87(a), the Taxpayers are not entitled to the claimed refund.

VIII. RECOMMENDATION

Based on the above analysis, the Hearing Officer recommends as follows: Pursuant to R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-87(a), the Taxpayers are not entitled to the claimed refund and the Division properly denied Taxpayers' claim for a refund.

Date: September 28, 2021

Catherine R. Warren
Hearing Officer

ORDER

I have read the Hearing Officer's Decision and Recommendation in this matter, and I hereby take the following action with regard to the Decision and Recommendation:

✓ ADOPT
_____ REJECT
_____ MODIFY

Dated: 9/29/21

Neena S. Savage
Tax Administrator

NOTICE OF APPELLATE RIGHTS

THIS DECISION CONSTITUTES A FINAL ORDER OF THE DIVISION. THIS ORDER MAY BE APPEALED TO THE SIXTH DIVISION DISTRICT COURT PURSUANT TO R.I. Gen. Laws § 44-30-90 WHICH STATES AS FOLLOWS:

> **§ 44-30-90 Review of tax administrator's decision.** *(a) General.* Any taxpayer aggrieved by the decision of the tax administrator or his or her designated hearing officer as to his or her Rhode Island personal income tax may within thirty (30) days after notice of the decision is sent to the taxpayer by certified or registered mail, directed to his or her last known address, petition the sixth division of the district court pursuant to chapter 8 of title 8 setting forth the reasons why the decision is alleged to be erroneous and praying relief therefrom. Upon the filing of any complaint, the clerk of the court shall issue a citation, substantially in the form provided in § 44-5-26 to summon the tax administrator to answer the complaint, and the court shall proceed to hear the complaint and to determine the correct amount of the liability as in any other action for money, but the burden of proof shall be as specified in § 8-8-28.
>
> *(b) Judicial review sole remedy of taxpayer.* The review of a decision of the tax administrator provided by this section shall be the exclusive remedy available to any taxpayer for the judicial determination of the liability of the taxpayer for Rhode Island personal income tax.
>
> *(c) Date of finality of tax administrator's decision.* A decision of the tax administrator shall become final upon the expiration of the time allowed for petitioning the district court if no timely petition is filed, or upon the final expiration of the time for further judicial review of the case.

CERTIFICATION

I hereby certify that on the 29th day of September, 2021 a copy of the above Decision and Notice of Appellate Rights were sent by first class mail, postage prepaid and certified mail, return receipt requested to the Taxpayers' address on file with the Division and by eletronic delivery to Michael Brady, Esquire, Department of Revenue, One Capitol Hill, Providence, RI 02903.

Gail Belasco